Evaluating the Java Monitor
Object Motivating Example

Douglas C. Schmidt
d.schmidt@vanderbilt.edu
www.dre.vanderbilt.edu/~schmidt

Institute for Software
Integrated Systems
Vanderbilt University
Nashville, Tennessee, USA
Learning Objectives in this Part of the Lesson

• Understand what monitors are & know how Java built-in monitor objects can ensure mutual exclusion & coordination between threads
• Note a human-known use of monitors
• Recognize common synchronization problems in concurrent Java programs using the BuggyQueue case study app
• Be aware of common complexities in concurrent programs like BuggyQueue
Evaluating the Buggy Producer/Consumer
Evaluating the Buggy Producer/Consumer

- Key question: what’s the output & why?
Evaluating the Buggy Producer/Consumer

• Key question: what’s the output & why?

Exception in thread "Thread-1" java.lang.NullPointerException
at java.util.LinkedList.unlink(LinkedList.java:211)
at java.util.LinkedList.remove(LinkedList.java:526)
at edu.vandy.buggyqueue.model.BuggyQueue.poll(BuggyQueue.java:52)
at edu.vandy.BuggyQueueTest$Consumer.run(BuggyQueueTest.java:104)
at java.lang.Thread.run(Thread.java 745)

Depending on the implementation of the BuggyQueue class & the underlying LinkedList the app & test program may simply “hang”
Evaluating the Buggy Producer/Consumer

- Key question: what’s the output & why?

```java
static class BuggyQueue<E> implements BoundedQueue<E> {
    private LinkedList<E> mList = new LinkedList<E>();

    public boolean offer(E e) {
        if (!isFull()) { mList.add(e); return true; }
        else return false;
    }

    public E poll() {
        if (!isEmpty()) return mList.remove(0); else return false; 
    }
    ...
}
```

There’s no protection against critical sections being run by multiple threads concurrently

Note that this implementation is not synchronized. If multiple threads access a linked list concurrently, and at least one of the threads modifies the list structurally, it must be synchronized externally. (A structural modification is any operation that adds or deletes one or more elements; merely setting the value of an element is not a structural modification.)

See docs.oracle.com/javase/8/docs/api/java/util/LinkedList.html
Common Complexities in Concurrent Programs
Common Complexities in Concurrent Programs

• Concurrent programs are hard to develop & debug, due to various inherent & accidental complexities

See stackoverflow.com/questions/499634/how-to-detect-and-debug-multi-threading-problems
Concurrent programs are hard to develop & debug, due to various inherent & accidental complexities, e.g.

- **Deadlock**
  - Occurs when two or more competing actions are each waiting for the other to finish, & thus none ever do

See en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Deadlock
Common Complexities in Concurrent Programs

• Concurrent programs are hard to develop & debug, due to various inherent & accidental complexities, e.g.
  • Deadlock
  • Starvation
    • A thread is perpetually denied necessary resources to process its work

See [en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Starvation_(computer_science)](en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Starvation_(computer_science))
Common Complexities in Concurrent Programs

- Concurrent programs are hard to develop & debug, due to various inherent & accidental complexities, e.g.
  - Deadlock
  - Starvation
  - Race conditions
    - *Arise when an application depends on the sequence or timing of threads for it to operate properly*

See [en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Race_condition](en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Race_condition)
Common Complexities in Concurrent Programs

• Concurrent programs are hard to develop & debug, due to various inherent & accidental complexities, e.g.
  • Deadlock
  • Starvation
  • Race conditions
  • Tool limitations
    • e.g., behavior in the debugger doesn’t reflect actual behavior

See en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Heisenbug

The act of observing a system can alter its state
Common Complexities in Concurrent Programs

- Some concurrency complexities can be fixed by applying Java built-in monitor object mechanisms

```
SimpleBlockingQueue
synchronized put()
synchronized poll()
synchronized offer()
synchronized poll()
```

`SimpleBlockingQueue` contains `Producer`, `Wait Queue`, `Entrance Queue`, `Consumer`
Common Complexities in Concurrent Programs

• There are also helpful techniques for debugging concurrent software

See www.drdobbs.com/cpp/multithreaded-debugging-techniques/199200938
There are also helpful techniques for debugging concurrent software, e.g.

- Use well-established concurrency & synchronization patterns & frameworks

Common Complexities in Concurrent Programs

- There are also helpful techniques for debugging concurrent software, e.g.
  - Use well-established concurrency & synchronization patterns
  - Conduct code reviews

- Am I able to understand the code easily?
- Is the function or class too big?
- Is the code following coding Standards / Guidelines?
- Can I Unit Test or Debug the code easily?
- Is the code duplicated more than twice?

See [en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Code_review](en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Code_review)
Common Complexities in Concurrent Programs

- There are also helpful techniques for debugging concurrent software, e.g.
  - Use well-established concurrency & synchronization patterns
  - Conduct code reviews
  - Apply automated analysis tools

Static Analysis Tools for Concurrency

- **FindBugs** – works on Java. In the list of bugs detected all of the “Multithreaded correctness” bugs are relevant to concurrency. Command-line interface or eclipse plugin (eclipse plugin update site: [http://findbugs.cs.umd.edu/eclipse/](http://findbugs.cs.umd.edu/eclipse/))
- **Lint** – a UNIX tool for C
- **JLint** – a Java version of Lint that is available as stand alone or eclipse plugin (eclipse plugin update site: [http://www.jutils.com/eclipse-update](http://www.jutils.com/eclipse-update))
- **Parasoft JTest** – commercial tool that combines static analysis and testing. Has capability to check for thread safety in multithreaded Java programs.
- **Coverity Static Analysis and Static Analysis Custom Checkers** – commercial tool that can be used to create custom static analyzers to find concurrency bugs in C/C++ programs.
- **GrammaTech’s CodeSonar** – commercial tool that can detect a special case race condition and locking issues in C/C++ (see datasheet for list of all bugs detected).
- **Chord** – static and dynamic analysis tool for Java (listed above as well).
- **JSure for Concurrency** – a commercial tool from SureLogic that is currently available in early release.
- **ESC/Java 2** – can detect race conditions and deadlocks – requires annotation (more...)
- **Relay** – static race detection
- **RacerX** – uses flow-sensitive static analysis tool for detection race conditions and deadlocks in C [paper] [slides]
- **SyncChecker** – a tool developed by F. Otto and T. Moschyn for finding race conditions and deadlocks in Java. Reduce false positives by combining static analysis with points-to and may-happen-in-parallel (MHP) information.
- **Warlock** – race detection tool for C – requires annotation.

See [www.sqrlab.ca/blog/2012/03/02/static-analysis-tools-for-concurrency](http://www.sqrlab.ca/blog/2012/03/02/static-analysis-tools-for-concurrency)
There are also helpful techniques for debugging concurrent software, e.g.

- Use well-established concurrency & synchronization patterns
- Conduct code reviews
- Apply automated analysis tools
- Instrument code with logging & tracing statements

See [www.dre.vanderbilt.edu/~schmidt/PDF/DSIS_Chapter_Waddington.pdf](http://www.dre.vanderbilt.edu/~schmidt/PDF/DSIS_Chapter_Waddington.pdf)
End of Evaluating the Java Monitor Object
Motivating Example